

**MEETING RECORD FOR THE 144<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE  
GREAT LAKES SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD**

**Great Lakes Regional Office, Windsor, ON  
February 28, 2007**

**MEMBERS PRESENT**

Michael J. Donahue (United States Co-chair)	URS Corporation, Farmington Hills, MI
John Carey (Canadian Co-chair)	NWRI, Burlington, ON
John Braden	University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign, IL
William Bowerman	Clemson University, Pendleton, SC
David Carpenter	University at Albany, Rensselaer, NY via conference call
C. Scott Findlay	University of Ottawa, ON
Donna Mergler	University of Quebec, Montreal, PQ
Judith Perlinger	Michigan Technological University, Houghton, MI via conference call
Deborah Swackhamer	University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN via conference call
Jay Unwin	National Council for Air and Stream Improvement, Inc., Kalamazoo, MI
Marcia Valiante	University of Windsor, ON

**MEMBERS ABSENT**

Milton Clark	United States Environmental Protection Agency, Chicago, IL
Pierre Filion	Ottawa, ON
Allan Jones	Burlington, ON
David Lean	University of Ottawa, ON
Joan Rose	Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI

**INVITEES/OBSERVERS**

Webb Smathers	Clemson University, Pendleton, SC
---------------	-----------------------------------

**LIAISONS & IJC STAFF**

Douglas Alley	International Joint Commission, GLRO
Kay Austin	International Joint Commission, Washington DC
Peter Boyer	International Joint Commission, GLRO
Bruce Kirschner	International Joint Commission, GLRO
Karen Vigmostad	International Joint Commission, GLRO
Joel Weiner	International Joint Commission, Ottawa ON

## **Draft Minutes of the 144th Meeting of the Great Lakes Science Advisory Board**

### **1. Welcome and Introductions**

Dr. Donahue brought the meeting to order at 8:35 AM and welcomed all those in attendance. He recognized and welcomed Dr. Carey back to the SAB and to his first meeting as SAB Canadian Co chair. Brief self introductions then followed for the benefit of those attending the meeting by conference phone.

### **2. Approval of Agenda**

The agenda was approved as presented, and no other items of business were proposed for discussion.

### **3. Invited Scientific Presentation:**

"Inferential strength, weight of evidence and evidence-informed decision making", Dr. Scott Findlay, Director, Institute of the Environment, University of Ottawa. Dr. Findlay's presentation is available to Board members in PPT format and in hard copy.

### **4. SAB Membership and Structural Alternatives**

Dr. Donahue addressed the need to develop a list of names from which a pool of candidates could be nominated for appointment to the SAB. He noted that the majority of terms of appointment will expire by the end of December 2007. Concern was expressed about appointing new members when restructuring the Board was being also being considered, since membership depends to a great extent on Board structure. Dr. Donahue stated that an approach to restructuring would be proposed by the Work Group on Emerging Issues, and that membership was a nearer term issue. Dr. Carey commented that no matter what organizational changes are made, it would be extremely unlikely that the Parties would change the role of the SAB or not recognize its need. Dr. Donahue suggested that Board members submit names of possible candidates, and that the rest of the IJC family be solicited to provide names as well. Once a long list has been generated, he suggested that an ad hoc group review the list and develop a pool for further review by the Board, and ultimately for submission to the IJC along with recommendations from the Co chairs for new appointments and reappointments.

### **5. IJC Update**

- Biennial Meeting, June 6 -8, 2007

It was reported that planning for the technical sessions were proceeding, and that those members who were involved in the sessions have been contacted and are participating. It was noted that the SAB will meet on the first day, June 6. Several Board members requested that hotel and meeting information be forwarded as

soon as possible in order to secure travel and accommodation arrangements in Chicago.

- IJC Great Lakes Priorities Process  
The IJC briefing note and flow chart explaining the process was distributed and summarized by the GLRO Director, Dr. Vigmostad and the Board Secretary.

## 6. Work Group Work Plan Activities

- WGEH  
Dr. Bowerman reviewed the Work Group activities that would form the basis for input to the Board report - microbial source tracking, dam removals and fish consumption benefits of omega 3's. The applicability of the Hibbeln Study to the Great Lakes was discussed, and it was noted that while its recommendations may be justified within the context of fish from England that have low mercury levels, it did not apply to the Great Lakes, and needed to be placed within a wider context of North American research on fish consumption. Dr. Bowerman concluded with a recommendation that Mr. Fox's SAB service be acknowledged by a letter from the Co Chairs.
- WGPI  
Mr. Unwin reported that the Work Group was addressing two IJC priorities, Groundwater and Sustainable Cities. He stated that the Work Group was planning to make a presentation at the Semi Annual Meeting, and would present their findings and conclusions on groundwater. Professor Valiante reported that there were serious concerns with the progress of the multi Board "Report Writing Steering Committee" who was charged with preparing the multi Board report. She said that the Work Group was aware of the high Commission expectations for this work, and that there did not appear to be sufficient effort being provided by the other groups involved. The secretary was directed to confirm a conference call with those involved as soon as possible, and ensure that the report progress was not stalled through lack of Board involvement in the report preparation process. The Work Group indicated that they would take the lead with the activity, on behalf of the SAB to ensure that a high quality report was produced.
- WGEI  
Dr. Swackhammer addressed the Work Group activities of climate change, weight of evidence and the application of the principles precaution, adaptation and robustness. She indicated these have been explored using invited scientific presentations to the Board in terms of the broader aspects, but that they will be highlighted to raise awareness of them, through the SAB's report. She noted that the February 2006 Wingspread workshop would form the major contribution of the Work group to the Board Report.

Dr. Swackhammer said that the Work Group is proposing that a new priority under the Commission's "Accountability" theme, examine the expert advisory structure of the Commission with a view to improving its effectiveness. She proposed that this could be accomplished by reviewing other scientific advisory institutions, and determining what worked best and how successful approaches might be adapted by the Commission. She said that she anticipated that a year would be required for such an activity, and that it would need the involvement of the other Boards. She added that it would build on the Wingspread conferences that have been held to date.

7.

#### **8. Outline of Board Report**

An outline of the Board report was distributed, and it was suggested that the WG also include reporting on "Sustainable Cities" within its report, since it involved a significant effort from the Work Group on Parties Implementation.

Several suggestions were made regarding format of the report:

- Keep the report concise
- Put detailed content into an appendix
- Use a standard format for each section
- Base the organization of the report on the Board Terms of Reference in the Agreement, not on the Board Work Groups

The Secretary indicated that he would forward a revised outline to the Board based on these suggestions. (Attachment 1, forwarded March 5, 2007)

#### **9. Candidate Topics for IJC 2007-2009 Priorities**

The secretary indicated that he would summarize the candidate topics identified to date, and circulate them to the SAB for their review.

#### **10. Future Meetings**

Proposed meetings #'s 145 and 146 were approved.

#### **11. Adjournment**

There being no further business of the Board, Dr. Bowerman moved that the meeting be adjourned with seconding by Dr. Findlay. The motion was approved by all of those present.

2005 - 2007 IJC Science Advisory Report  
Draft 2 Outline

**1. Introduction**

- Role, Organization, and Participation of the SAB in 2005 - 2007 IJC Priorities

**2. Scientific Advice Arising from IJC Priority Activities**

- Review of the GLWQA - Wingspread Consultation on Strengthening science under a Renewed GLWQA
- Pathogens - Microbial Source Tracking
- Evaluating Dam Removals - An Ecosystem Approach
- Health Effects/New Chemicals - Omega 3's and Fish Consumption Advisories
- Groundwater
- Sustainable Cities

**3. Scientific Knowledge Pertinent to the Identification, Evaluation and Resolution of Current and Anticipated Problems related to Great Lakes Water Quality**

- Impact of Climate Change on Great Lakes Surveillance and Monitoring Activities
- Methodology for Assessing Weight of Evidence When Applying Great Lakes Science to Policy and Decision Making
- The Diabetes - PTS Link